Winners of the NSD-S Hub Student Essay Competition 2024

NATO STRATEGIC DIRECTION-SOUTH HUB

Website: www.southernhub.org

Twitter: NSD-S Hub

LinkedIn: NSD-S Hub

JFCNP HQ (Naples, Italy)

The NATO STRATEGIC DIRECTION-SOUTH HUB (NSD-S HUB) was established at Allied Joint Force Command Naples (JFCNP) in order to improve NATO awareness and understanding of common global challenges in the area of interest and to identify opportunities for cooperation with selected Partners, while contributing to the overall coordination of NATO activities and efforts.

NSD-S HUB products are developed with the direct engagement of regional experts, open-source information from governmental organisations, non-governmental organisations, international organisations, academic institutions, media sources and military organizations. By design, NSD-S HUB products or links to open-sourced and independently produced articles do not necessarily represent the opinions, views or official positions of any other organisation.

EVENT BACKGROUND

The NSD-S Hub Student Essay Competition is designed to stimulate discussions and critical thinking among young students and researchers from the Middle East and Africa. This project underscores the NSD-S Hub's work to integrate regional youth perspectives in its understanding and awareness of the Middle East, North Africa and Sahel and Sub-Saharan Africa.

The NSD-S Hub received tens of submissions, from students representing thirteen different countries across the Middle East and Africa. The most selected topics, linked to the guiding question of what can NATO do to address these shared challenges, were emerging technologies and AI, energy transitions and climate change. These insights further reinforce studies and surveys that have highlighted these topics as the most pressing issues for students across the Middle East and Africa.

The competition call was initially launched in April, with submissions accepted until 15 July. All submissions underwent a double-blind review process, with essays evaluated on criteria including novelty, coherence, relevance and impact, by NSD-S Hub Staff.

Preparations are already underway to launch the next iteration of the Student Essay Competition for 2025.

ABSTRACTS

NATO'S ROLE IN SECURITY CONCERNS ASSOCIATED WITH CLIMATE CHANGE IN THE MIDDLE EAST AND AFRICA

By Hope Daniel Rukundo

Climate change is accelerating due to rising CO_2 levels and greenhouse gas emissions, causing severe environmental and security risks. In vulnerable regions like the Middle East and Africa, climate-induced droughts, erratic rainfall, and rising sea levels intensify resource scarcity, political instability, and displacement. These conditions enable terrorist and criminal groups to exploit environmental vulnerabilities, leading to deforestation, land degradation, human trafficking, illegal mining, and violence, all of which worsen existing fragile governance systems. This essay examines NATO's role in addressing climate-driven security threats, emphasizing the need to integrate climate considerations into its strategic framework. Using Modern Systems Theory (MST), it examines the connections between environmental changes and socio-political instability. NATO must strengthen its disaster response capabilities, establish a climate security task force, and support sustainable development efforts. Intelligence, surveillance, and collaboration with governments, research institutions, and regional organizations must all be improved in order to lessen threats. Stability and preventing future conflicts require a holistic approach that takes human and environmental security into account. By implementing these strategies, NATO can make a substantial contribution to the promotion of peace and security in the Middle East, Africa, and beyond.

NATO-MEA ENERGY TRANSITION. LEVERAGING STRATEGIC PARTNERSHIPS FOR RENEWABLE ENERGY DEVELOPMENT AND SECURITY

By Ahmad Abdallah Salem Almasri

In the last decade, energy transition and addressing climate change have emerged as key challenges in the world due to significantly increasing energy demand. These challenges are becoming ever more important in developing countries, including countries in the Middle East and Africa (MEA) region. This essay presents the geopolitical landscape in the MEA region, which has enormous renewable energy sources such as solar, wind, and hydropower. Furthermore, it explores NATO's collaboration with its neighbors in the MEA region, as well as how to achieve energy transition and address climate change without compromising energy security and energy infrastructure. Throughout this essay, key recommendations, including regional frameworks, technology sharing, and capacity building are presented to ensure success and promote progress in the MEA countries.

AI'S DUAL ROLE IN DRIVING ONLINE TERRORIST CONTENT AND COUNTER STRATEGIES. Is NATO prepared for AI-enhanced extremism?

By Bar Fishman

Artificial intelligence (AI) is revolutionising global security and defence, particularly in the domain of online Counter Violent Extremism (CVE) efforts. The proliferation of AI tools has dramatically lowered barriers for creating and disseminating sophisticated terrorist content online, outpacing traditional detection and mitigation strategies. NATO faces a critical challenge as its existing methods for combating online radicalisation and terrorist propaganda become increasingly ineffective against AI-enhanced extremist content. The essay proposes a multidimensional strategy for NATO, marking the development of AI-driven early detection technologies, fostering international collaboration, updating policies, promoting regulation, and maintaining ongoing research and development. By adopting these measures, NATO can position itself at the forefront of AI-driven counterterrorism efforts, effectively countering those exploiting technologies for promoting disorder. The success of NATO's counterterrorism practices in the AI age will eventually depend on its ability to adapt swiftly, collaborate effectively, and innovate continuously in response to evolving digital threats.

CONTENTS

NATO'S ROLE IN SECURITY CONCERNS ASSOCIATED WITH CLIMATE CHANGE IN THE MIDDLE EAST AND AFRICA

By Hope Daniel Rukundo

1.1 Introduction

Climate change is accelerating at an unprecedented rate, driven by increased CO_2 concentrations and greenhouse gas emissions resulting from human activities (Dusenge et al., 2019; Hoegh- Guldberg et al., 2019; Kuzyakov et al., 2019). This rapid shift affects soil, water, plants and ecosystems, causing a global issue that extends beyond environmental concerns (Fleischer and Sternberg, 2006; Paz-Kagan et al., 2020; Tariq et al., 2022) and poses significant security risks (Trombetta, 2008). Africa and the Middle East (MEA) are among the most vulnerable regions, experiencing significant impacts from changing climate patterns, projected to intensify in the coming decades.

1. In Africa, the effects of climate change are diverse and region-specific. The continent is expected to witness a substantial increase in average temperatures, with some areas experiencing rises of up to 4°C by the end of the century. Some regions are facing prolonged droughts, while others experience more intense and unpredictable rainfall and rising sea levels (de Wit & Stankiewicz, 2006; Zittis et al., 2022), causing pest infestations, soil erosion, landslides, flooding and persistent droughts.
2. The Middle East is also set to experience severe climate impacts, with temperatures rising by over 2°C by mid-century and potentially exceeding 4°C by 2100, leading to more frequent and prolonged heatwaves, significant warming and increased water scarcity. Coastal areas, such as sections of the Nile Delta and the Persian Gulf, are at risk from rising sea levels which might cause flooding and the salinisation of freshwater resources. These effects are worsening socio-political-economic tensions and conflicts that already exist (Ward & Ruckstuhl, 2017; Hoffmann, 2018; Chin-Yee, 2019; Harmon, 2021). The Middle East and North Africa (MENA) is the world's most water-scarce region, with 11% of its land affected by rising soil salinisation, which is contributing to widespread issues with water management (Wicke et al., 2011). This scenario is predicted to get worse due to excessive aquifer pumping, declining water quality and the growing irrigation of marginal water sources to meet food demands and prevent desertification (Daba & Qureshi, 2021). Furthermore, excessive groundwater extraction may further raise soil and groundwater salinity, affecting environmental quality, agricultural production and human health. Rising sea levels may further hasten saltwater incursion into rich soils (Chenoweth et al., 2011; Dasgupta, et al., 2015).

Climate change increases the risk of conflict and criminal activity through direct pathways, such as resource scarcity and behavioural implications, and indirect ones, like decreased economic capabilities, migration and displacement (Savelli et al., 2023). As a result of these increasing threats, the number of affected individuals will grow exponentially in the coming decades (Almulhim et al., 2024). Models predict that by 2050, between 28.3 and 71.1 million people will be forced to migrate within the Africa, while approximately 19.6 million have already migrated beyond the continent, which remains the most climate-vulnerable region globally despite contributing the least to greenhouse gas (GHG) emissions (Almulhim et al., 2024; Barrios et al., 2006; Mutava, 2023). Numerous research studies examining how climate change affects agricultural production have revealed that 40 million people could face malnourishment if climate change continues at the current rate (Myers et al., 2017;

Corwin, 2020; Ripple et al., 2023). Climate-related disasters have resulted in substantial gross domestic product (GDP) losses, with 1.1 percent in MEA regions, threatening Africa's ability to achieve the Sustainable Development Goals (SDGs) (Koubi, 2019). These regions are particularly vulnerable to climatic changes caused by emissions from wealthier countries because of their strong reliance on climate-sensitive businesses like agriculture (Ayugi et al., 2023; Warren et al., 2024). These variations cause significant economic upheavals too, which threaten food security and public health, increase poverty and inequality and cast doubt on future stability (Friel, 2019). For instance, food insecurity and poverty can incentivise individuals to engage in anti-social behaviour, while warmer temperatures can elevate hostility and violence (Brück et al., 2017). Evidence shows a direct association between temperature rise and increased crime rates in various regions, such as sex offenses and crime in cities (Gamble et al., 2021).

Moreover, organized and disorganised crimes such as corporate pollution, illegal logging and human trafficking are on the rise due to climate-induced resource scarcity, particularly in developing nations (Kingdon & Gray, 2022). Alarmingly, MEA continues to suffer from long-term hazards, forcing many to live in more at-risk areas (Al-Akel, 2020; Gaaloul et al., 2022). These hazards create a melting pot of vulnerability exploited by terrorist organisations and mafia-like groups (Chitadze, 2022). Such entities hijack environmental resources (Kinyua, 2017) facilitated by corrupt, irresponsible, unaccountable and weak governance, compounded by the threats posed by non-state actors (Kingdon & Gray, 2022). According to Huisman & Sidoli (2019), these groups engage in deforestation, land degradation, water contamination, killing and uprooting innocent people and animals, and more. If these activities continue uncontrolled, they could seriously jeopardise global stability, as seen in the Democratic Republic of the Congo (Jackson, 2020; Consolee et al., 2024; Eichstaedt, 2011; Kinyua, 2017; Sovacool, 2021).

Climate change acts as a threat multiplier of political tensions and conflicts in MEA regions, exacerbating terrorism, conflicts and all forms of instability and insecurity (Abrahams & Carr, 2017; Ide, 2023). These issues are particularly acute over water resources and arable land, especially in areas with existing tensions and weak water governance (Nouri et al., 2023), overstretching societies' adaptive capacities in the short- to mid-term, potentially leading to destabilization and violence (de Almeida, 2023). This creates a complex web of social, economic and environmental stressors that jeopardise national and international security (Sotiroski, 2024). These issues will only worsen if nothing is done (Brzoska & Fröhlich, 2016). For example, the Syrian Civil War, which began in 2011, has been partially attributed to a severe drought from 2006 to 2010 that destroyed rural livelihoods and caused people to migrate to cities, which increased socio-economic hardship and fuelled the revolt. The resulting chaos allowed extremist groups like ISIS to gain a foothold (Gleick, 2014, Kelley, et al., 2015). Similarly, the shrinking of Lake Chad, which has lost 90% of its water since the 1960s due to climate change and human activities, has exacerbated resource competition and instability in the area (Ehiane & Moyo, 2021). This has contributed to the growth of Boko Haram, which has taken advantage of the civil unrest to enlist new members and launch assaults (Sambo & Sule, 2022). Lastly, the Nile River, which flows through 11 countries, is increasingly a source of tension due to changing rainfall patterns and the construction of the Grand Ethiopian Renaissance Dam (Hmoud, 2024). Egypt, which relies heavily on the Nile for water, fears reduced water flow, leading to diplomatic tensions and potential military confrontations with Ethiopia (Pemunta et al., 2021). Nonetheless, it is critical to understand that political systems will continue to function within their current socio-political contexts and that climate change effects is unlikely to alter them (Thompson, 2021; Jamie, 2022).

1.2 Connecting the relationship between natural and social systems to NATO's role

In order to understand how climate change influences socio-political systems and NATO's role, it is useful to apply the Modern Systems Theory (MST), formulated by Niklas Luhmann (de Molina et al., 2019). MST conceptualizes the world as consisting of discrete functional subsystems, such as law, politics and economics, each operating autonomously according to its logic. Despite their autonomy, these subsystems are interconnected through 'structural coupling', which allows them to influence each other.

In the context of climate change, the natural world (climate system) and the social world (socio-political systems) can be viewed as interconnected subsystems. The social subsystem detects changes in the natural subsystem, such as rising temperatures and extreme weather occurrences, and responds by its logic and capabilities. For example, prolonged drought could lead to water scarcity, prompting political responses like resource-sharing agreements or water rationing, while the economic sector might adjust prices or direct funding onto drought-resistant crops (Halden, 2007). Various countries may respond to similar climate-related concerns in different ways. Some may embrace technological innovation and collaboration, while others may engage in resource-related conflict. With this knowledge, NATO can evaluate the potential effects of climate change on international security dynamics and socio-political structures (Halden, 2007).

1.3 Concrete proposals for mitigating climate change security risks

Given this complex interplay between natural and social systems, NATO's role becomes crucial. Traditionally focused on military and geopolitical threats, NATO must integrate climate change into its strategic planning to strengthen security and stability, ultimately promoting peace and prosperity in the region (Swain and Jägerskog, 2016). Recognising climate change as an amplifier of crises and a multiplier of threats, the Alliance can continue to progress toward embedding climate considerations within its security paradigm (Proedrou, 2018; Läderach et al., 2021; Scheffran et al., 2023). To ensure its climate security discourse translates into action, several concrete proposals can help NATO address the root causes of instability and prevent the escalation of conflicts in these regions (Farhan et al., 2023). This involves incorporating climate awareness into NATO's core tasks deterrence, defence, crisis management, and cooperative security (Farhan et al., 2023; Szenes, 2023). As an international security alliance, NATO can be pivotal in addressing these security implications (Flockhart, 2024).

1.3.1 Establishing a climate security task force

NATO should create a special task force on climate security to address the security implications of climate change (Thomas, 2023). Through the facilitation of coordination amongst NATO countries, this task group would ensure a coherent and meticulously planned approach to climate resilience. Its primary responsibilities would include:

1. **Strategic planning and policy development:** Creating comprehensive strategies that integrate climate risk assessments within the operational and policy frameworks of NATO (Szabadföldi & Négyesi, 2023; Szenes, 2023).
2. **Resource coordination:** Centralising knowledge and resources to enable quick and easy solutions to security issues related to climate change (Bremberg et al., 2022; Ankler, 2023).
3. **Training and capacity building:** Providing NATO personnel and Allies

specialised training on climate security challenges, such as resilience building and disaster response (Porter & Vaklinova, 2021).

4. **Collaboration with external entities:** Engaging with international organisations, regional governments, and civil society to ensure a holistic and inclusive approach to climate security (Lindstrom et al., 2019; Wright, 2023).

1.3.2 Enhancing disaster response capabilities

In tackling climate-related security issues, NATO should prioritise enhancing disaster response capabilities in MEA (Rico, 2022). Given the increasing frequency and intensity of human-induced climate-related disasters in these regions (Ramirez et al., 2021), it is imperative to reinforce local capacity to respond effectively (Akpuokwe et al., 2024). NATO can assist in multiple ways:

1. **Training and technical assistance:** Providing emergency preparedness, crisis management and disaster response training to local military and civilian personnel. This includes conducting joint exercises to improve coordination and readiness.
2. **Resource provision**: Supplying local forces and humanitarian organisations with necessary tools and resources, such as medical supplies, communication devices and infrastructural assistance to increase their capacity.
3. **Rapid response teams**: Establishing teams that can be rapidly dispatched to aid places devastated by disasters to guarantee an expeditious and well-coordinated global reaction to crises.

1.3.3 Supporting sustainable development initiatives

Long-term sustainable development programmes are needed to address the underlying causes of insecurity brought on by climate change. In the MEA, NATO can be extremely helpful in advancing and funding initiatives that increase resilience and reduce susceptibility to climate change. Key areas of focus include:

1. **Renewable energy projects:** Renewable energy sources, such as geothermal, hydro, solar and wind power, are emerging as markers of progress and promise. These sustainable alternatives present a comprehensive solution to the environmental challenges posed by fossil fuels (Mahdavi et al., 2023; Qazi et al., 2019). Along with many positive effects on the economy and health, they also guarantee a decrease in greenhouse gas emissions. As renewable technologies advance, they become increasingly cost-competitive with traditional energy sources, driving job creation, promoting energy independence and improving air quality and public health (Yu et al., 2024). NATO is under pressure to cut the CO_2 emissions of its military activities, in line with the COP 26 targets set by countries that are also NATO Member States, which call for a 50% reduction by 2030 and a net zero emission by the middle of the century (Locci, 2023). Though reaching these goals will be difficult due to fossil fuel-dependent military hardware being recurrently used, CO_2 emission-reducing tactics must be modified Polsky et al., 2019).
    - NATO could establish a Green Fund to help less developed members make the switch to renewable energy (Belaïd et al., 2023).
    - Furthermore, the forces of Allies have the option of implementing environmentally friendly methods such as employing battery-operated vehicles, electric-powered robotics, drones, 3D manufacturing for energy-efficient production, and rail and waterways for supply transportation (Chen et al., 2022; Jamie, 2022).
    - The Alliance should develop a standard technique for measuring

military CO_2 emissions, emphasising the importance of transparency and accountability in reporting (Thomas, 2023).

In general, promoting the use of renewable energy projects, like hydroelectric, solar and wind power can reduce dependency on fossil fuels, cut greenhouse gas emissions and give underprivileged people access to sustainable energy options (Salazar, 2023).

1. **Sustainable agriculture practices:** Endorsing programmes that encourage the conservation of soil, water management and sustainable farming methods. These methods can raise residents' standards of living, lessen land degradation and increase food security.
2. **Water conservation and management:** Collaborating with local governments and organisations to develop and implement water conservation strategies (Kalogiannidis et al., 2023). This includes improving irrigation systems, building water storage infrastructure and promoting efficient water use.

1.3.4 Strengthening intelligence and surveillance

Robust intelligence and surveillance capabilities are necessary for efficient monitoring and response to security issues associated with climate change (Szabadföldi & Négyesi, 2023). NATO can improve its capacity to recognise, evaluate and respond to climate-related risks by utilising its cutting-edge intelligence infrastructure and collaborations with regional entities (Farhan et al., 2023; Selisny et al., 2023). Key actions would include:

1. **Enhanced data collection**: Real-time monitoring of resource availability, population migrations, illegal mining and environmental changes is achieved through the use of data analytics, satellite images and remote sensing technology.
2. **Intelligence sharing:** Encouraging NATO members and their regional allies to share intelligence about climate change. As part of this, knowledge of new risks, effective techniques and lessons discovered should be shared (Selisny et al., 2023).
3. **Early warning systems and risk assessment**: Including possible crisis risks from climate stress in NATO's early-warning system (Shea, 2022). In order to create a multidimensional human security model that specifies precise metrics to evaluate these risks and associated security challenges, it will be necessary to construct a strong analytics and intelligence system that integrates a range of data (Levshun & Kotenko, 2023). This includes scenario planning and predictive modelling to inform decision-making processes.

1.3.5 Fostering international cooperation

A coordinated effort involving multiple stakeholders is required to effectively address the security implications of climate change in the MEA (Kim & Garcia, 2023). International collaboration is essential to organise responses to complex security concerns, exchange best practices and pool resources (Aamer, 2023). NATO can play a pivotal role in fostering dialogue and cooperation among diverse actors by:

1. **Facilitating multilateral dialogues:** Organising forums, conferences and workshops that bring together governments, international organisations, academia and civil society to discuss climate security issues and develop joint strategies (Salazar, 2023).
2. **Promoting regional partnerships:** Building and strengthening partnerships with regional organisations such as the African Union and the Arab League. This includes collaborative initiatives on climate resilience, disaster response and sustainable development.

3. **Supporting cross-border initiatives:** Encouraging and supporting cross-border projects that address shared climate security challenges. This includes transboundary water management, regional renewable energy grids and collaborative disaster response mechanisms.

1.3.6 Peacebuilding and conflict prevention

In areas where climate change intensifies already-existing conflicts, NATO's engagement in peacebuilding and conflict prevention is essential (Krampe et al., 2024). Comprehensive and inclusive strategies are needed to address the underlying causes of instability, such as competition and resource shortages (Patel & Lucey, 2024). NATO can contribute to peacebuilding efforts through:

1. **Mediation and dialogue facilitation:** Promoting dialogue and cooperation among conflicting parties to address disputes over resources and territory. NATO can act as a neutral mediator, fostering trust and collaboration.
2. **Supporting local peace initiatives:** Providing support to local peacebuilding organisations and initiatives that work to resolve conflicts at the community level. This includes funding, training and technical assistance.
3. **Integrating climate considerations into peacebuilding:** Ensuring that climate change impacts are considered in peacebuilding strategies and conflict prevention efforts (Sommer & Fassbender, 2024). This includes addressing climate-induced migration, resource disputes and environmental degradation as part of broader peacebuilding frameworks.

1.3.7 Collaboration with research institution

In order to handle the intricate security issues that climate change presents, research and innovation are essential. NATO should work with academic institutions to produce recommendations and actionable insights for improving climate security. (House & Square, 2024). Key areas of collaboration include:

1. **Joint research projects:** Collaborating on research initiatives to find novel approaches to climate resilience and security with academic institutions and research centres. This includes studies on the impacts of climate change on security dynamics and the effectiveness of mitigation strategies. Through this collaboration, for example, case studies can be carried out to analyse the effects of environmental degradation and climate change on nations and areas of strategic interest to the alliance, and contingency planning can be done regarding the implications for NATO's posture and capabilities if the alliance is called upon to assist. Moreover, successful innovative solutions like desalination and wastewater reuse in Israel can help NATO in addressing water scarcity, promote stability and put an end to water related conflicts in vulnerable regions like MEA, which rely heavily on groundwater, but struggle to secure investment for large-scale water projects (Sowers et al., 2011).
2. **Knowledge sharing platforms:** Establishing platforms for the sharing of climate security- related studies, best practices and research findings. Publications, conferences and online databases fall under this category.
3. **Technical assistance and expertise:** Leveraging the expertise of academic institutions to provide technology support and consulting services to NATO and its partners. This includes modelling of climate change, policy analysis and risk assessments. Assign each ally and the NATO Secretary General a special counsellor on environmental security and climate change.

Given the prevailing global climate change crisis and escalating CO_2 emissions, NATO should put its emphasis on collaborative, adaptation, implementation and

support projects, like afforestation, as a crucial approach to mitigating these impacts by sequestering CO_2, offsetting emissions and restoring degraded soil (Slider, 2023). NATO can adopt the remarkable example of the Yatir pine forest, which has thrived for almost 60 years without irrigation or fertilisation in an arid region characterised by extremely low precipitation and water deficits (Pozner et al., 2022; Tal & Gordon, 2010).

1.4 Conclusions

The MEA are particularly vulnerable to the security risks posed by climate change. Thus, NATO must take preventive measures and coordinate their actions (Glancey, 2023; Okolie & Prince, 2024). NATO, as a key security alliance, has the potential to play a crucial role in addressing the security implications of climate change in these regions (Causevic & Al-Marashi, 2023). The intersection of climate change and security requires innovative and forward-thinking approaches. Concrete measures to address climate change security risks based on a comprehensive security approach encompassing human, community, state and international security (Liverman, 2008) are required. This comprehensive approach is necessary because of the complexity of climate-related security risks that can simultaneously threaten the security of multiple entities, including people, communities, states, the international system, the environment, and ecology. Additionally, climate-related security threats also affect foreign policy, defence, development, the economy, and the environment, among other policy domains (Kıprızlı, 2023; Lippert, 2019). The complex and varied nature of these risks necessitates careful conceptualisation and analysis of organisational responses, as the internal understanding of these can significantly influence policy outcomes (Saraiva & Monteiro, 2023) to secure a future for the MEA, and beyond. By implementing the aforementioned plan, NATO should actively address existing security risks resulting from climate change and prevent the emergence of new challenges (Gruszczak, 2023).

References

- Aamer, F. (2023). Water security: diplomacy, global cooperation, and effective management of shared rivers. Konrad-Adenauer Foundation & Stimson Center.
- Abrahams, D., & Carr, E. R. (2017). Understanding the connections between climate change and conflict: contributions from geography and political ecology. Current Climate Change Reports, 3(4), 233–242. doi: 10.1007/s40641-017-0080-z
- Al-Akel, A. S. (2020). Short and Long-Term Impacts of Climate Change on Population Health in Yemen. Journal of Environment and Earth Science.
- Almulhim, A. I., Alverio, G. N., Sharifi, A., Shaw, R., Huq, S., Mahmud, M. J., … Abubakar, I. R. (2024). Climate-induced migration in the Global South: an in-depth analysis. Npj Climate Action, 3(1), 47. doi: 10.1038/s44168-024-00133-1
- Ankler, E. (2023). Climate Security Synergies?: Investigating the Policy Responses of the EU and NATO.
- Ayugi, B. O., Chung, E.-S., Zhu, H., Ogega, O. M., Babousmail, H., & Ongoma, V. (2023). Projected changes in extreme climate events over Africa under 1.5, 2.0and 3.0global warming levels based on CMIP6 projections. Atmospheric Research,292, 106872. doi: 10.1016/j.atmosres.2023.106872
- Barrios, S., Bertinelli, L., & Strobl, E. (2006). Climatic change and rural-urban migration: The case of sub-Saharan Africa. Journal of Urban Economics.
- Belaïd, F., Al-Sarihi, A., & Al-Mestneer, R. (2023). Balancing climate mitigation and energy security goals amid converging global energy crises: The role of green investments. Renewable Energy, 205, 534–542. doi: 10.1016/j.renene.2023.01.083
- Bremberg, N., Mobjörk, M., & Krampe, F. (2022). Global responses to climate security: discourses, institutions and actions. Journal of Peacebuilding & Development, 17(3), 341–356. doi: 10.1177/15423166221128180
- Brück, T., Habibi, N., Martin-Shields, C., & Sneyers, A. (n.d.). The relationship between food security and violent conflict. ….
- Brzoska, M., & Fröhlich, C. (2016). Climate change, migration, and violent conflict: vulnerabilities, pathways and adaptation strategies. Migration and Development, 5(2), 190–210. doi: 10.1080/21632324.2015.1022973
- Caruso, G. (2017). Public health and safety: The social determinants of health and criminal behavior. Gregg D. Caruso.
- Causevic, A., & Al-Marashi, I. (2023). NATO and anthropogenic strategic security. Connections: The Quarterly Journal, 22(1), 67–78. doi: 10.11610/Connections.22.1.16
- Chenoweth, J., Hadjinicolaou, P., Bruggeman, A., Lelieveld, J., Levin, Z., Lange, M. A., … Hadjikakou, M. (2011). Impact of climate change on the water resources of the eastern Mediterranean and Middle East region: Modeled 21st-century changes and implications. Water Resources Research, 47(6). doi: 10.1029/2010WR010269
- Chen, J., Sun, J., & Wang, G. (2022). From unmanned systems to autonomous intelligent systems. Engineering,12, 16–19. doi: 10.1016/j.eng.2021.10.007Chidiogo Uzoamaka Akpuokwe, Adekunle Oyeyemi Adeniyi, Seun Solomon Bakare, & Nkechi Emmanuella Eneh. (2024). Legislative responses to climate change: a global review of policies and their effectiveness. International Journal of Applied Research in Social Sciences, 6(3), 225–239. doi: 10.51594/ijarss. v6i3.852
- Chin-Yee, S. (2019). Climate change and human security: case studies linking vulnerable populations to increased security risks in the face of the global climate challenge. King's College London: EUCERS Strategy Paper.
- Chitadze, N. (2022). Global security and political problems of the 21st century. In N. Chitadze (Ed.), World politics and the challenges for international security (pp. 24–95). IGI Global. doi: 10.4018/978-1-7998-9586-2.ch002
- Consolee, K. T., Luan, X., & Cong, L. (2024). Anthropogenic pressures on gorillas: A case of Grauer's gorillas in Maiko National Park, the democratic

republic of Congo. Diversity,16(4), 236. doi: 10.3390/d16040236
- Corwin, D. L. (2020). Climate change impacts on soil salinity in agricultural areas. European Journal of Soil Science. doi: 10.1111/ejss.13010
- Daba, A. W., & Qureshi, A. S. (2021). Review of soil salinity and sodicity challenges to crop production in the lowland irrigated areas of Ethiopia and its management strategies. Land, 10(12), 1377. doi: 10.3390/land10121377
- Daoust, G., & Selby, J. (2022). Understanding the politics of climate security policy discourse: the case of the Lake Chad basin. Geopolitics, 1–38. doi: 10.1080/14650045.2021.2014821
- Dasgupta, S., Hossain, M. M., Huq, M., & Wheeler, D. (2015). Climate change and soil salinity: The case of coastal Bangladesh. Ambio, 44(8), 815–826. doi: 10.1007/s13280-015- 0681-5
- DA Jackson. (2020). Imperialism: Alive and Well in the Democratic Republic of the Congo.
- de Almeida Saraiva, F. A. R. (2023). The Defining Crisis of our Time: Climate Change and Migration. Institute for Political Studies.
- de Molina, M. G., Petersen, P. F., Peña, F. G., & Caporal, F. R. (2019). Political agroecology: advancing the transition to sustainable food systems. CRC Press. doi: 10.1201/9780429428821
- de Wit, M., & Stankiewicz, J. (2006). Changes in surface water supply across Africa with predicted climate change. Science, 311(5769), 1917–1921. doi: 10.1126/science.1119929
- Dellmuth, L. M., Gustafsson, M.-T., Bremberg, N., & Mobjörk, M. (2017). Intergovernmental organizations and climate security: advancing the research agenda. Wiley Interdisciplinary Reviews: Climate Change, 9(1), e496. doi: 10.1002/wcc.496
- Eichstaedt, P. (2011). Consuming the Congo: war and conflict minerals in the world's deadliest place. books.google.com.
- Ehiane, S., & Moyo, P. (2021). Climate change, human insecurity, and conflict dynamics in the Lake Chad region. Journal of Asian and African Studies, 002190962110638. doi: 10.1177/00219096211063817Farhan, A., Kossmann, S., & van Rij, A. (2023). Preparing NATO for climate-related security challenges. Royal Institute of International Affairs. doi: 10.55317/9781784135799
- Flockhart, T. (2024). NATO in the multi-order world. International Affairs, 100(2), 471–489. doi: 10.1093/ia/iiae004
- Friel, S. (2019). Climate change and the people's health (N. Krieger, Ed.). Oxford University Press. doi: 10.1093/oso/9780190492731.001.0001
- Gaaloul, N., Eslamian, S., & Katlane, R. (2022). Socio economic impacts of Hydrological Hazards and Disasters in Tunisia. Water Sciences and Environment.
- Gamble, J. L., & Hess, J. J. (2012). Temperature and violent crime in Dallas, Texas: relationships and implications of climate change. The Western Journal of Emergency Medicine, 13(3), 239–246. doi: 10.5811/westjem.2012.3.11746
- Glancey, S. M. (2023). National security implications of global warming: the US military at the leading edge of climate responsiveness.
- Gleick, P. H. (2014). Water, Drought, Climate Change, and Conflict in Syria. Weather, Climate, and Society, 6(3), 331–340. doi: 10.1175/WCAS-D-13-00059.1
- Gruszczak, A. (2023). Military intelligence in support of EU missions and operations: bridging the strategic vulnerability gap. International Journal of Intelligence and Counter Intelligence, 1–18. doi: 10.1080/08850607.2023.2189847
- Harmon, D. (2021). Climate change contributions to conflict: an analysis of Syria, Yemen and Egypt.
- Heilmann, K., Kahn, M. E., & Tang, C. K. (2021). The urban crime and heat gradient in high and low poverty areas. Journal of Public Economics, 197, 104408. doi: 10.1016/j.jpubeco.2021.104408
- Hmoud, S. (2024). The Dam Problem: The Controversy of the Grand Ethiopian Renaissance Dam.
- Hoffmann, C. (2018). Environmental determinism as Orientalism: The geo-political ecology of crisis in the Middle East. Journal of Historical Sociology, 31(1), 94–104. doi: 10.1111/johs.12194
- House, C., & Square, R. (2024). Unravelling The EU's Space Policy and Strategy: Impacts on Security and defense evolution.
- Huisman, W., & Sidoli, D. (2019). Corporations, human rights and the environmental degradation–corruption nexus. Asia Pacific Journal of Environmental Law,22(1), 66–92. doi: 10.4337/apjel.2019.01.04
- Ide, T. (2023). Rise or recede? How climate disasters affect armed conflict intensity. International Security, 47(4), 50–78. doi: 10.1162/isec_a_00459
- Jamie Shea. (2022, March 11). NATO and Climate Change: Better Late Than Never | German Marshall Fund of the United States. Retrieved July 2, 2024, from German Marshall Fund of the United States website: https://www.gmfus.org/news/nato-and-climate-change- better-late-never
- Kalogiannidis, S., Kalfas, D., Giannarakis, G., & Paschalidou, M. (2023). Integration of Water Resources Management Strategies in Land Use Planning towards Environmental Conservation. Sustainability, 15(21), 15242. doi: 10.3390/su152115242
- Kelley, C. P., Mohtadi, S., Cane, M. A., Seager, R., & Kushnir, Y. (2015). Climate change in the Fertile Crescent and implications of the recent Syrian drought. Proceedings of the National Academy of Sciences of the United States of America, 112(11), 3241–3246. doi: 10.1073/pnas.1421533112
- Kim, K., & Garcia, T. F. (2023). Climate change and violent conflict in the Middle East and North Africa. International Studies Review, 25(4). doi: 10.1093/isr/viad053
- Kingdon, A., & Gray, B. (2022). The Class Conflict Rises When You Turn up the Heat: An Interdisciplinary Examination of the Relationship between Climate Change and Left-Wing Terrorist Recruitment. Terrorism and Political Violence, 34(5), 1041–1056. doi: 10.1080/09546553.2022.2069935
- Kinyua, D. (2017). Conflict Financing and Civil War in Africa: Case Study of Democratic Republic of Congo.
- Kıprızlı, G. (2023). The Risk-Based Analysis of Climate Change: The Arctic as a Pressing Security Concern within NATO's Strategic Framework and Finland's Accession to NATO. PERCEPTIONS: Journal of International Affairs.
- Koubi, V. (2019). Sustainable development impacts of climate change and natural disaster.… Paper Prepared for Sustainable Development Outlook.
- Krampe, F., O'Driscoll, D., Johnson, M., Simangan, D., Hegazi, F., & de Coning, C. (2024). Climate change and peacebuilding: sub-themes of an emerging research agenda. International Affairs, 100(3), 1111–1130. doi: 10.1093/ia/iiae057
- Läderach, P., Ramirez-Villegas, J., Prager, S. D., Osorio, D., Krendelsberger, A., Zougmoré,R. B., … Pacillo, G. (2021). The importance of food systems in a climate crisis for peace and security in the Sahel. International Review of the Red Cross,103(918), 995–1028. doi: 10.1017/S1816383122000170
- Levshun, D., & Kotenko, I. (2023). A survey on artificial intelligence techniques for security event correlation: models, challenges, and opportunities. Artificial Intelligence Review, 56(8), 8547–8590. doi: 10.1007/s10462-022-10381-4
- Lindstrom, G., Tardy, T., Fiott, D., Kaunert, C., & Lété, B. (2019). The EU and NATO. The Essential Partners ….
- . Lippert, T. H. (2019). NATO, climate change, and international security: A risk governance approach. Cham: Springer International Publishing. doi: 10.1007/978-3-030- 14560-6
- Liverman, D. (2008). Assessing impacts, adaptation, and vulnerability: Reflections on the Working Group II Report of the Intergovernmental Panel on Climate Change. Global Environmental Change, 18(1), 4–7. doi: 10.1016/j.gloenvcha.2007.09.003
- Locci, E. (2023). Climate Diplomacy International and National Responses.Mahdavi, M., Awaafo, A., Jurado, F., Vera, D., & Verdú Ramos, R. A. (2023). Wind, solar and biogas power generation in water-stressed areas of Morocco considering water and biomass availability constraints and carbon emission limits. Energy, 282, 128756. doi: 10.1016/j.energy.2023.128756
- Mutava, M. (2023). An analysis of trend and patterns of migration in Africa.
- Myers, S. S., Smith, M. R., Guth, S., Golden, C. D., Vaitla, B., Mueller, N. D., … Huybers,P. (2017). Climate change and global food systems: potential impacts on food security and undernutrition. Annual Review of Public Health, 38, 259–277. doi: 10.1146/annual- publhealth-031816-044356
- Nouri, M., Homaee, M., Pereira, L. S., & Bybordi, M. (2023). Water management dilemma in the agricultural sector of Iran: A review focusing on water governance. Agricultural Water Management, 288, 108480. doi: 10.1016/j.agwat.2023.108480
- Okolie, A. M., & Prince, O. C. (2024). Global security challenges and sustainable development in africa: an analysis of climate-change-as-a-new security-threat …. ESCET Journal of ….
- Patel, J., & Lucey, A. (2024). Scarcity and instability: Transforming societies through equitable distribution mechanisms. Journal of Regional Security, 19(1), 29–57. doi: 10.5937/jrs19-41648
- Pemunta, N. V., Ngo, N. V., Fani Djomo, C. R., Mutola, S., Seember, J. A., Mbong, G. A., & Forkim, E. A. (2021). The Grand Ethiopian Renaissance

Dam, Egyptian National Security, and human and food security in the Nile River Basin. Cogent Social Sciences,7(1). doi: 10.1080/23311886.2021.1875598

- Polsky, M., Connelly, J., Barr, C., Garcia, J., & Negrao, D. (2019). Defending the Green New Deal: Recommendations to Build on What's Actually in it While Reaching.
- Porter, V., & Vaklinova, G. (2021). Climate Change and Security: Emerging Challenges and the Role of NATO. Chief Editor.
- Pozner, E., Bar-On, P., Livne-Luzon, S., Moran, U., Tsamir-Rimon, M., Dener, E., … Klein,T. (2022). A hidden mechanism of forest loss under climate change: The role of drought in eliminating forest regeneration at the edge of its distribution. Forest Ecology and Management, 506, 119966. doi: 10.1016/j.foreco.2021.119966
- Proedrou, F. (2018). Energy Policy and Security under Climate Change. Cham: Springer International Publishing. doi: 10.1007/978-3-319-77164-9
- Qazi, A., Hussain, F., Rahim, N. ABD., Hardaker, G., Alghazzawi, D., Shaban, K., & Haruna, K. (2019). Towards sustainable energy: A systematic review of renewable energy sources, technologies, and public opinions. IEEE Access : Practical Innovations, Open Solutions, 7, 63837–63851. doi: 10.1109/ACCESS.2019.2906402
- Ramirez, M. A. M., Stevenson, L. A., Pulhin, J. M., & Inoue, M. (2021). National Policies and Programs on Climate Change and Disaster Risks that Address Human Security. In J. M. Pulhin, M. Inoue, & R. Shaw (Eds.), Climate change, disaster risks, and human security: Asian experience and perspectives (pp. 345–372). Singapore: Springer Singapore. doi: 10.1007/978-981-15-8852-5_17Rico, L. G. (2022). NATO and Climate Change: A Climatized Perspective on Security. frdelpino.es.
- Ripple, W. J., Wolf, C., Gregg, J. W., Rockström, J., Newsome, T. M., Law, B. E., … King,S. D. A. (2023). The 2023 state of the climate report: Entering uncharted territory.Bioscience. doi: 10.1093/biosci/biad080
- Salazar, V. (2023). From practices to praxis: ASEAN's transnational climate governance networks as communities of practice. Journal of Current Southeast Asian Affairs, 42(2), 190–215. doi: 10.1177/18681034231167443
- Sambo, U., & Sule, B. (2022). Climate change, depletion of Lake Chad, and its impacts on agricultural output, food security, and social order in the Sahel. In The Palgrave Handbook of global social change (pp. 1–23). Cham: Springer International Publishing. doi: 10.1007/978-3-030-87624-1_11-1
- Saraiva, A., & Monteiro, A. (2023). Climate change as a risk to human security: a systematic literature review focusing on vulnerable countries of Africa and adaptation strategies. International Journal of Global ….
- Savelli, A., Schapendonk, F., Dutta Gupta, T., Pacillo, G., & Läderach, P. (2023). Climate change, mobility, and violent conflict: a typology of interlinked pathways. International Development Planning Review, 45(4), 403–436. doi: 10.3828/idpr.2023.2
- Scheffran, J., Guo, W., Krampe, F., & Okpara, U. (2023). Tipping cascades between conflict and cooperation in climate change. doi: 10.5194/ergosphere-2023-1766
- Selisny, L., Clack, T., Burwell, T., & Nugee, R. (2023). Climate intelligence in theory and practice. In Climate change, conflict and (in)security: hot war (pp. 254–280). London: Routledge. doi: 10.4324/9781003377641-15
- Slider. (2023, July 18). Analysis: how NATO should move forward on emissions reporting- CEOBS. Retrieved July 13, 2024, from https://ceobs.org/analysis-how-nato-should-move- forward-on-emissions-reporting/
- Sommer, U., & Fassbender, F. (2024). Environmental Peacebuilding: Moving beyond resolving Violence-Ridden conflicts to sustaining peace. World Development, 178, 106555. doi: 10.1016/j.worlddev.2024.106555
- Sotiroski, L. (2024). The impact of climate change on national security. International Journal of Sustainable Development and Planning, 19(1), 391–401. doi: 10.18280/ijsdp.190138
- Sovacool, B. K. (2021). When subterranean slavery supports sustainability transitions? Power, patriarchy, and child labor in artisanal Congolese cobalt mining. The Extractive Industries and Society, 8(1), 271–293. doi: 10.1016/j.exis.2020.11.018
- Sowers, J., Vengosh, A., & Weinthal, E. (2011). Climate change, water resources, and the politics of adaptation in the Middle East and North Africa. Climatic Change, 104(3–4), 599– 627. doi: 10.1007/s10584-010-9835-4
- Swain, A., & Jägerskog, A. (2016). Emerging security threats in the Middle East: The impact of climate change and globalization. books.google.com.Szabadföldi, I., & Négyesi, I. (2023). The Comprehensive Approach of Military Strategic Operations Planning and its support by Artificial Intelligence. Honvédségi ….
- Szenes, Z. (2023). Reinforcing deterrence: assessing NATO's 2022 Strategic Concept. Defense & Security Analysis, 39(4), 539–560. doi: 10.1080/14751798.2023.2270230
- Tal, A., & Gordon, J. (2010). Carbon cautious: Israel's afforestation experience and approach to sequestration. Small-Scale Forestry, 9(4), 409–428. doi: 10.1007/s11842-010- 9125-z
- Thomas, M. (2023). Climate change and military forces. In Maria J. Trombetta (Ed.), Handbook on climate change and international security (pp. 219–237). Edward Elgar Publishing. doi: 10.4337/9781789906448.00022
- Thompson, W. R., & Zakharova, L. (2021). Climate change in the Middle East and North Africa: 15,000 years of crises, setbacks, and adaptation. Abingdon, Oxon; New York, NY: Routledge, 2021.: Routledge. doi: 10.4324/9781003158127
- Trombetta, Maria Julia. (2008). Environmental security and climate change: analyzing the discourse. Cambridge Review of International Affairs, 21(4), 585–602. doi: 10.1080/09557570802452920
- Ward, C., & Ruckstuhl, S. (2017). Water scarcity, climate change and conflict in the Middle East: securing livelihoods, building peace. I.B. Tauris. doi: 10.5040/9781350989719
- Warren, R., Price, J., Forstenhäusler, N., Andrews, O., Brown, S., Ebi, K., … Wright, R. (2024). Risks associated with global warming of 1.5 to 4 °C above pre-industrial levels in human and natural systems in six countries. Climatic Change, 177(3), 48. doi: 10.1007/s10584-023-03646-6
- Wicke, B., Smeets, E., Dornburg, V., Vashev, B., Gaiser, T., Turkenburg, W., & Faaij, A. (2011). The global technical and economic potential of bioenergy from salt-affected soils. Energy & Environmental Science, 4(8), 2669–2681. doi: 10.1039/c1ee01029h
- Wright, K. A. (2023). Challenging civil society perceptions of NATO: Engaging the Women, Peace and Security agenda. Cooperation and Conflict, 58(1), 61–80. doi: 10.1177/00108367221084561
- Yu, H., Wen, B., Zahidi, I., Chow, M. F., Liang, D., & Madsen, D. Ø. (2024). The critical role of energy transition in addressing climate change at COP28. Results in Engineering, 22, 102324. doi: 10.1016/j.rineng.2024.102324
- Zittis, G., Almazroui, M., Alpert, P., Ciais, P., Cramer, W., Dahdal, Y., … Lelieveld, J. (2022). Climate change and weather extremes in the Eastern Mediterranean and Middle East. Reviews of Geophysics. doi: 10.1029/2021RG000762

NATO-MEA ENERGY TRANSITION: LEVERAGING STRATEGIC PARTNERSHIPS FOR RENEWABLE ENERGY DEVELOPMENT AND SECURITY

By Ahmad Abdallah Salem Almasri

1.1 Introduction

1.1.1 Geopolitical landscape of the MEA region

The Middle East and Africa (MEA) region covers a varied area encompassing multiple countries with diverse energy resources and governance structures. When we refer to the Middle East, we typically include countries from Egypt to Iran, spanning across the Arabian Peninsula and the Levant. Meanwhile, Africa, extends from the southern Mediterranean Sea to the southernmost tip of Cape of Good Hope. Both regions showcase a wide range of cultural, linguistic and economic characteristics (Hafner, Raimondi and Bonometti, 2023).

The Middle East is widely known for its abundant hydrocarbon resources, in particular oil and gas. With some of the largest proven oil reserves in the world (Saudi Arabia, Iran, Iraq and UAE, for example) - this region is a key player in the global energy market. The resource base for Africa, however, is significantly more diversified. While some leading oil producers include countries such as Nigeria, Angola and Libya, the continent is resource-rich in other minerals including gold, diamonds and copper. Africa has also a significant amount of untapped renewable energy resources, mainly solar and wind (Griffiths, 2017).

It is difficult to analyse the MEA region politically, given the mosaic of governance mechanisms. The Middle East is home to diverse forms of government that include monarchies (Saudi Arabia and Jordan) and republics (Egypt and Syria) with differing degrees in terms of the spectrum between autocratic rule and democracy. The political landscape is also quite varied in Africa, from stable democracy (South Africa and Ghana) to countries which are still riddled by conflict, due to weak governance (Somalia, South Sudan and others). Political diversity in the region is a critical factor when considering regional cooperation and the implementation of energy policies.

European powers have played a rather profiled and complex role within the MEA region for a long time. Analysing the early twentieth century, Britain, France, and Italy colonized large parts of Africa and, to a lesser extent, parts of the Middle East. The impacts have resulted in the post-colonial political and economic systems in these areas. For instance, the drawing of country borders without regard to ethnic or cultural differences, which to date has caused problems and political issues.

For these reasons, the geopolitics of the MEA region cannot be ignored to better understand the patterns of change in the energy domain. Differences in political institutions and resource availability influence the region’s energy policies and cooperation with organizations such as NATO (Causevic, 2017).

1.1.2 The challenge of energy security

The energy outlook of the MEA is characterized by great possibilities, as well as pressing challenges. At the centre of all these issues is the fact that the region is hugely reliant on fossil fuels, especially oil and natural gas, for both national energy demands and as a key source of revenue through export earnings. Some of the major non-renewable energy producing nations include Saudi Arabia, Iraq and Qatar for oil, and Algeria, Egypt and Nigeria for natural gas, respectively (Griffiths, 2017).

Despite having abundance of hydrocarbon resources, the MEA region faces a dual challenge. First, countries need to meet the rising energy demand, caused by growing

populations and increasing urbanization and industrialization. In parallel, these same countries must diversify energy sources in the long-term to reduce the risks of relying too much on global energy markets.

Many economies in the region are extremely sensitive to fluctuations in income deriving from the export of fossil fuels because these make up such a large portion of national income and government revenues. This is particularly true in the current climate of unstable prices and changes in the global energy market, due in part to the focus on renewable sources and climate change policies (Griffiths, 2017).

In addition, the achievement of energy security is crucial for the enhancement of socio-economic development of the overall MEA region. The development of energy infrastructure, including the generation and distribution of electrical energy, is often still inadequate, especially in rural areas (IEA, 2022). This hampers the development of sustainable, equitable development processes and enhances socio-economic cleavages.

Energy security is, therefore, clearly another important issue to address, and since renewable energy is one of the most promising opportunities for the region, further investments in it should be made. Moving towards cleaner energy sources not only develops the variety of energy sources but also decreases the emissions of greenhouse gases and other negative impacts related to the use of fossil fuels and the extraction of resources.

Therefore, despite the availability of enormous energy resources in the MEA region, rising in energy demand along with energy infrastructure inequality, indicate the need of enforcing quality energy policies for sustainable, secure, and inclusive energy across the MEA region (Griffiths, 2017).

1.1.3 Climate change: The need to act

Fighting climate change has emerged as an essential issue for humanity as a whole and, in this respect, the Middle East and Africa (MEA) is one of the most pressing regions. Climate change is an exigent problem because extreme weather conditions are becoming more frequent and severe, temperatures are rising, along with other negative consequences to the environment. Thus, climate is an acute issue since it influences the health of ecosystems, people's well-being, and the economy. The MEA region, with such diverse climate systems and ecosystems, is sensitive to the negative impacts of climate change such as desertification, water deficiency and agricultural interference (Causevic, 2017).

Using fossil-based energy sources to power the MEA region is disastrous to the environment hence the need for change to green energy sources. The hydrocarbon dependency of the region not only accounts for large emissions of greenhouse gases, and consequent climate change impacts for the world, but also exposes the region's economy to risks associated with volatile oil prices and changing global demand for cleaner resources. Solar and wind energy is one such option, being sustainable, ensuring energy security, job creation and sustainable development.

Moreover, international agreements that are pertinent to climate policies, including the 2015 Paris Climate Accord, help shape and galvanize actions on climate change in the MEA region. The objective of the Paris Accord is to prevent global warming to below 1 or 2 degrees Celsius with respect to pre-industrial levels (UNFCCC, 2016).

Every nation, including the nations in MEA region, must present nationally determined commitments in terms of reducing emissions and preparing for impacts of climate change.

In relation to the MEA, the Paris Accord can be described as both a challenge and a possibility. The countries in the region have made various pledges that include the

installation of renewable power, energy efficiency and measures to cater for climate change impacts. For instance, Morocco has laid down aggressive policies to achieve over 52% of its electricity from renewable sources by 2030 (ESFC, no date). On the same note; the UAE has planned to achieve 50% of their energy from clean energy by 2030 (Government of Dubai, 2023).

Furthermore, regional approaches should require international assistance and cooperation for the region to attain its climate agenda. The governments of developing country should strive to finance, transfer technology and build human capacity so that MEA countries can avoid the abovementioned barriers and develop renewable energy sources. Global and regional organizations, including NATO, can also contribute to enhancing the efforts by including climate change aspects into security and development.

Ultimately, it is evident that the need to act on climate change mitigation in the MEA region is well-based on the necessity of shifting from fossil fuels to renewable energy sources. Through analysing theories of international obligations and agreements, the role of international cooperation comes to the forefront for the accomplishment of sustainable development, and the managing of climate change can be explained according to the Paris Accord and other global agreements.

1.2 Energy transition in the MEA region

1.2.1 Renewable energy potential

In a certain sense, the MEA region has abundant fossil fuels, as this has hampered the shift towards the utilization of sustainable energy. The potential is limitless for solar, wind, geothermal and hydro power, which largely remains untapped still today. This could provide growth opportunities the economies of countries, as well as offer the security of domestic energy supply and increased political stability.

1.2.1.1 Solar Energy

The MEA receives one of the most powerful solar radiations (Global Solar Atlas, no date) and, therefore, solar power is one of the most promising renewable energy sources. Photovoltaic and concentrated solar power projects are highly developed in the MEA region because of the availability of large tracts of sandy land, excellent sunshine, heat intensity and climatic conditions. For example, the Morocco Noor Ouarzazate Solar Complex, which is among the biggest concentrated solar power plants across the globe, has boosted Morocco's renewable energy capacity. The goal of the complex is to generate 580MW of electricity (The Guardian, 2016), which would provide for a million households.

1.2.1.2 Wind Energy

Wind energy is also an equally promising form of renewable energy especially in the coastal- plateau and hilly areas across the MEA. Egypt and Morocco have had good wind status and, thus, have invested in wind energy resources. Other large wind farms in Africa include Egypt's Gulf of Suez Wind Farm, with a generation capacity of 545MW (Energy Capital and Power, 2023). In the same context, the Tarfaya Wind Farm in Morocco has the capacity of 300 MW (UNFCCC, 2012) and is one of the brightest examples of the successful implementation of wind energy in the region.

1.2.1.3 Geothermal Energy

Geothermal energy, though less widespread, presents significant potential in the Rift Valley region of East Africa. Countries like Kenya have tapped into geothermal resources to diversify their energy sources. For example, the Olkaria Geothermal Power Plant is one of the largest geothermal projects in Africa, with a capacity

exceeding 720MW (JPT, 2023) This project underscores the potential of geothermal energy to provide a reliable and sustainable power source in geologically active regions.

1.2.1.4 Hydropower

Hydropower remains a critical component of the renewable energy landscape across the MEA region, particularly in Sub-Saharan Africa. The region's major river systems, such as the Nile, Congo and Zambezi, offer substantial hydropower potential. Ethiopia's Grand Ethiopian Renaissance Dam, expected to generate over 6,000 MW of electricity upon completion, and exemplifies the transformative potential of hydropower projects in Africa (Mulat, 2014). Despite political and environmental challenges, hydropower remains a key strategy for many African nations seeking to increase their renewable energy capacity.

1.2.2 The role of regional cooperation

Regional cooperation among MEA countries is crucial for facilitating a smooth energy transition. By collaborating on knowledge sharing, technology transfer and grid interconnectivity, MEA countries can overcome individual limitations and achieve collective energy goals more effectively.

1.2.2.1 Knowledge sharing and technology transfer

Regional cooperation enables countries to share best practices, innovations, and lessons learned in renewable energy development. This collective approach can accelerate the adoption of effective policies and technologies across the region. For example, the African Renewable Energy Initiative promotes regional cooperation to boost renewable energy projects, facilitating knowledge exchange and capacity building (AREI, no date).

1.2.2.2 Grid interconnectivity

Grid interconnectivity is essential for optimizing energy resources across borders. Integrated grids allow countries to balance supply and demand more efficiently, reduce reliance on fossil fuels and enhance energy security. The Gulf Cooperation Council (GCC) Interconnection Authority is a prime example, connecting the power grids of 6 GCC countries to enhance reliability and efficiency (Mediterranean Institute for Regional Studies, 2023).

1.2.2.3 Collaborative projects

Collaborative renewable energy projects can attract larger investments and reduce costs through economies of scale. Regional organizations like the League of Arab States and the African Union support joint ventures and regional initiatives to develop large-scale renewable energy infrastructure.

In conclusion, regional cooperation among MEA countries are vital for a successful energy transition. By sharing knowledge, transferring technology, and interconnecting grids, the region can enhance its renewable energy capabilities, improve energy security and achieve sustainable development.

1.3 NATO's role and strategy

1.3.1 NATO's evolving role in the southern neighbourhood

Historically, NATO's engagement in the MEA region has been centred on traditional security concerns, such as counter-terrorism, maritime security and crisis management (NATO, 2022). However, the evolving geopolitical landscape and the recognition of emerging non-traditional threats have prompted NATO to adapt its

strategy to address issues like climate change and energy security, which are increasingly intertwined with regional stability.

1.3.1.1 Climate change and security

NATO acknowledges that climate change acts as a “threat multiplier”, exacerbating existing vulnerabilities and potentially leading to increased conflict and instability (Causevic, 2017). In response, NATO has integrated climate change into its strategic framework. This includes enhancing resilience and preparedness of member and partner nations to climate impacts, such as extreme weather events, water scarcity and displacement. NATO's Science for Peace and Security Programme funds projects that address climate and energy security, fostering collaboration and innovation in these fields (Causevic, 2017).

1.3.1.2 Energy Security

Energy security is another critical area where NATO’s role is expanding. Recognizing the MEA region’s significance as a global energy supplier, NATO supports efforts to secure energy infrastructure and supply routes (NATO – Topic, 2024). This includes protecting critical energy infrastructure from terrorist attacks and cyber threats, as well as ensuring the stability of energy markets. NATO's Strategic Direction South-Hub (NSD-S Hub) plays a pivotal role in analysing and addressing energy security challenges in the region, promoting cooperation with regional partners (NATO – News, 2024).

1.3.1.3 Collaborative efforts

NATO's evolving strategy involves greater collaboration with international organizations, regional bodies and local governments. By fostering partnerships, NATO aims to enhance capacity-building, support sustainable development, and promote stability through comprehensive approaches that address both traditional and emerging security threats (NATO, 2022).

In conclusion, NATO’s strategy in the MEA region is evolving to address the multifaceted challenges of climate change and energy security. By integrating these issues into its strategic framework and fostering regional cooperation, NATO aims to enhance stability and resilience in its southern neighbourhood.

1.3.2 NATO’s potential contributions to energy transition

NATO’s expertise in project management, logistics and cybersecurity can significantly contribute to the development and security of energy infrastructure in the MEA region.

1.3.2.1 Project management and logistics

NATO’s proficiency in large-scale project management can ensure efficient planning, coordination and execution of renewable energy projects. NATO can provide technical assistance and training to local governments and organizations, helping them implement and maintain renewable energy initiatives. Furthermore, NATO’s logistical capabilities can facilitate the rapid deployment of necessary materials and personnel, overcoming the region's often challenging terrain and infrastructure limitations (NATO – News, 2024)

1.3.2.2 Cybersecurity

Energy infrastructure is increasingly vulnerable to cyber-attacks which can disrupt supply chains and pose serious security risks. NATO’s extensive experience in cybersecurity (NATO – Topic, 2024) can help safeguard critical energy infrastructure. By implementing advanced cyber defence mechanisms and conducting regular security assessments, NATO can protect energy facilities from cyber threats. Additionally, NATO can offer cybersecurity training to regional partners, enhancing their capacity to respond to and mitigate against cyber incidents.

1.3.2.3 Collaboration and capacity building

NATO's collaborative approach can foster partnerships with regional organizations, governments and the private sector. This cooperation can lead to the exchange of best practices, innovative technologies, and financial resources, thereby accelerating the region's energy transition. By leveraging its comprehensive network and expertise, NATO can play a pivotal role in advancing sustainable energy projects in the MEA region (Causevic, 2017).

1.3.3 Challenges and considerations for NATO

1.3.3.1 Concerns about militarization

NATO's involvement in the energy transition may raise concerns about the militarization of civilian energy projects. To address these concerns, NATO must clearly delineate its role as supportive rather than directive, emphasizing its technical and logistical contributions rather than military presence. Transparent communication and active engagement with local stakeholders can help build trust and mitigate fears of militarization (Causevic, 2017), (NATO – Topic, 2024).

1.3.3.2 Ensuring transparency and inclusivity

Transparency and inclusivity are crucial for the success of NATO's involvement in the energy transition. By involving local communities, governments and civil society organizations in decision-making processes, NATO can ensure that projects are culturally sensitive, locally relevant and widely accepted. Regular consultations and feedback mechanisms can help tailor NATO's support to the specific needs and preferences of the MEA region (NATO – Topics, 2011), (NATO – Topic, 2024).

1.4 Collaboration for a sustainable energy future

1.4.1 Case Study: A successful collaboration

A tangible example of successful collaboration between NATO, through the Science for Peace and Security Programme, and an MEA country on sustainable energy is the Sahara Trade Winds to Hydrogen project, implemented along the Atlantic coast from Morocco to Senegal (NATO – Topics, 2011). The Atlantic coast is one of the highest wind energy potentials in the world. For instance, the annual capacity factor of wind power at Dakhla, Morocco (located on the Atlantic coast, approximately 6 km inland) is around 40%, indicating an excellent location for wind energy generation on a global scale (El Khchine, 2019).

1.4.1.1 Factors contributing to success

The success of this collaboration can be attributed to several key factors:

1. Attracting investments lead to develop local economies, and therefore, increase the access to basic energy services and mitigate the flow of migrant populations.
2. NATO provided technical expertise in project management, logistics and cybersecurity, crucial for the sustainable of renewable energy infrastructure.
3. International funding and assistance facilitated by NATO help overcome initial investment barriers.
4. Collaborative efforts focused on building local capacity through training and knowledge transfer.

1.4.1.2 Lessons learned

The partnership underscores the importance of:

1. Having clear objectives by aligning goals and expectations from the outset.
2. Ensuring benefits are equitable and sustainable for all parties involved.
3. Involving local communities in decision-making processes to ensure projects are socially and culturally acceptable.

This case study highlights how international collaboration, supported by NATO's expertise and resources, can catalyse successful energy projects in the MEA region.

1.4.2 Framework for future collaboration

Future collaboration between NATO, MEA countries and international stakeholders to accelerate the energy transition should prioritize:

1. Capacity building by developing local expertise in renewable energy technologies and management.
2. Knowledge sharing to facilitate exchanges on best practices in policy, technology and regulatory frameworks.
3. Coordinated efforts to attract investment and funding for sustainable energy projects.

This framework should aim to strengthen regional energy security, promote sustainable development and mitigate climate impacts through coordinated action and shared resources.

References

- Africa To Overtake Europe in Geothermal Capacity by 2030 (2023). Available at: https://jpt.spe.org/africa-to-overtake-europe-in-geothermal-capacity-by-2030.
- AREI | Africa Renewable Energy Initiative - Official Website (no date). Available at: https://www.arei.info/eng.
- Biggest Solar Energy and Wind Projects in Egypt (2023). Available at: https://energycapitalpower.com/biggest-solar-energy-wind-projects-egypt/.
- Causevic, A. (2017) 'Facing an Unpredictable Threat: Is NATO Ideally Placed to Manage Climate Change as a Non-Traditional Threat Multiplier?', Connections: The Quarterly Journal, 16(2), pp. 59–80. Available at: https://doi.org/10.11610/CONNECTIONS.16.2.04.
- CDM: Tarfaya Wind Farm Project (300 MW) - ONE/MAROC/WIND/TARFAYA 300 (2012). Available at: https://cdm.unfccc.int/ProgrammeOfActivities/cpa_db/0BMDH2965YFKVLSZQW4ECU1GA3XPNT/view.
- Dubai announces ambitious plan to achieve 50% reduction in carbon emissions by 2030 (2023). Available at: https://mediaoffice.ae/en/news/2023/December/08-12/Dubai-announces-ambitious-plan-to-achieve-50-per-reduction-in-carbon-emissions-by-2030.
- Global Solar Atlas (no date). Available at: https://globalsolaratlas.info/map?c=0.337491,-5.800781,2&s=22.444345,21.972656&m=site.
- Griffiths, S. (2017) 'A review and assessment of energy policy in the Middle East and North Africa region', Energy Policy, 102, pp. 249–269. Available at: https://doi.org/10.1016/J.ENPOL.2016.12.023.
- Hafner, M., Raimondi, P.P. and Bonometti, B. (2023) 'The MENA Region: An Economic, Energy, and Historical Context', Perspectives on Development in the Middle East and North Africa (MENA) Region, Part F1210, pp. 3–25. Available at: https://doi.org/10.1007/978-3-031-30705-8_1/FIGURES/10.
- Key findings – Africa Energy Outlook 2022 – Analysis - IEA (2022). Available at: https://www.iea.org/reports/africa-energy-outlook-2022/key-findings.
- Morocco poised to become a solar superpower with launch of desert mega-project | Solar power | The Guardian (2015). Available at: https://www.theguardian.com/environment/2015/oct/26/morocco-poised-to-become-a-solar-superpower-with-launch-of-desert-mega-project.
- Mulat, A.G. et al. (2014) 'Assessment of the Impact of the Grand Ethiopian Renaissance Dam on the Performance of the High Aswan Dam', Journal of Water Resource and Protection, 6(6), pp. 583–598. Available at: https://doi.org/10.4236/JWARP.2014.66057.
- NATO - News: Group of experts publishes report on NATO's southern neighbourhood, 07-May.-2024 (2024). Available at: https://www.nato.int/cps/en/natohq/news_225245.htm.
- NATO - News: NATO launches five new multinational cooperation initiatives that enhance deterrence and defence, 17-Oct.-2024 (2024). Available at: https://www.nato.int/cps/en/natohq/news_229664.htm?selectedLocale=en.
- NATO - Topic: Energy security (2024). Available at: https://www.nato.int/cps/en/natohq/topics_49208.htm.
- NATO 2022 - Strategic concept (2022). Available at: https://www.nato.int/strategic-concept/.
- NATO Topics: Sahara Trade Winds to Hydrogen : Applied Research for Sustainable Energy Systems (2011). Available at: https://www.nato.int/issues/science-environmental-security/projects/8/index.html.
- Noor Ouarzazate: the world's largest concentrated solar power plant built in Morocco (no date). Available at: https://esfccompany.com/en/articles/solar-energy/noor-ouarzazate-the-world-s-largest-concentrated-solar-power-plant-csp-built-in-morocco/.
- Strengthening Energy Security: The GCC-Iraq Electrical Interconnection Project (2023). Available at: https://www.mirs.co/details.aspx?jimare=208.
- The Paris Agreement | UNFCCC (2016). Available at: https://unfccc.int/process-and-meetings/the-paris-agreement.
- El Khchine, Y., Sriti, M., & El Kadri Elyamani, N. E. (2019). Evaluation of wind energy potential and trends in Morocco. Heliyon, 5(6), e01830. https://doi.org/10.1016/J.HELIYON.2019.E01830
- NATO Topics: Sahara Trade Winds to Hydrogen : Applied Research for Sustainable Energy Systems. (2011). Retrieved February 18, 2025, from https://www.nato.int/issues/science-environmental-security/projects/8/index.html

AI'S DUAL ROLE IN DRIVING ONLINE TERRORIST CONTENT AND COUNTER STRATEGIES:[1] IS NATO PREPARED FOR AI-ENHANCED EXTREMISM?

By Bar Fishman

1.1 Introduction

Passaris (2020) argues that in the fast-paced, innovative environment of the 21st century, technology is developing far more rapidly than our ability to investigate its impact and evaluate its consequences. This is quite evident in the rapid development and mass utilisation of Artificial Intelligence (AI) based technologies. These advancements hold cross-sector implications, particularly in the domains of security and defence (Burton & Soare, 2019).

According to a report from the NATO Strategic Communications Centre of Excellence (Juršėnas et al., 2021), AI tools, like text-based chatbots (OpenAI's ChatGPT, Antrophic's Claude, Google Gemini, and others), image and video generators (Microsoft Designer, Midjourney, OpenAI's DALL-E 3, et cetera), and voice generators (Microsoft VALL-E, Suno, and more), are relevant for both maintaining and disrupting global order and security. Despite having extensive knowledge and experience in combating terrorist content and employing detection methods, NATO now finds itself at a critical juncture as methods used to combat online radicalization and terrorist propaganda on social media may prove futile in a world dominated by AI tools.

This essay argues that AI represents a radical shift in online counterterrorism (CT) efforts, particularly in NATO's priority areas of detection technologies and Countering Violent Extremism (CVE) (NATO, 2024). The rise of AI-powered terrorist content online is dramatically transforming the digital ecology, challenging existing detection methods, and potentially altering the restraints of online radicalisation and extremist propaganda (Fernandez & Alani, 2021; Hall et al., 2019). The current knowledge gap lies in understanding how AI simultaneously facilitates the proliferation of terrorist content and enhances CT measures. Therefore, NATO members must develop innovative approaches and strengthen their collaboration to address new threats and new challenges.

1.2 AI in CT: Evolution and revolution

AI technology has significantly lowered the barriers for creating sophisticated terrorist content. The accessibility of AI tools, for example, OpenAI's ChatGPT and DALL-E, Claude, Microsoft Copilot and others, often available for free and requiring minimal technical expertise, parallels the earlier surge in extremist content on social networking sites (SNS) (Fernandez & Alani, 2021). This democratisation of AI technology has severe implications for online security, as recognized by NATO (Kandemir & Brand, 2018; Juršėnas et al., 2021). While it is evident that generative AI enables the creation of false information, the critical issue lies in its capacity to produce highly believable and emotionally charged false content. This represents a significant threat, as the unparalleled quality of such fabricated content, ranging from fake photos to counterfeit documents, can be generated within seconds.

For instance, AI-driven algorithms can analyse user behaviour to create personalised content that is more likely to engage and further radicalise individuals (Sayed et al., 2023). AI tools can also generate deepfakes and other advanced pieces of misinformation that are challenging to detect and counter using traditional methods,

[1] The author thanks Dr. Ilan Manor and Ms. Nitzan Yarkoni for their essential contributions to this draft, as well as for their valuable comments and support on earlier versions.

such as manual content review and simple algorithmic detection (Rana, 2022; Westerlund, 2019). These facts underscore the urgent need to develop AI-based countermeasures that can keep pace with these advancements.

The evolution of AI in terrorist content creation has been documented by several studies. Olson et al. (2019) and Venkatesh (2020) highlight how AI tools enable the creation of sophisticated propaganda with minimal effort. AI-powered applications can generate deepfakes, automate social media posts, and create convincing fake content, which are then disseminated to radicalise and recruit individuals. In recent months, some terrorist organisations have also released guidelines on how to use AI to develop propaganda and disinformation. For instance, the Islamic State (Daesh) published a tech support guide on how to securely use generative AI tools during the summer of 2023, while a pro-al-Qaeda outlet released several posters with images highly likely created with generative AI (Nelu, 2024; Tech Against Terrorism, 2023).

Additionally, far-right figures have produced a *guide to memetic warfare* advising others on using AI-generated image tools to create extremist memes; pro-Islamic State affiliates have used generative AI to translate propaganda speeches into multiple languages, and al-Qaeda affiliates have similarly utilised generative AI for propaganda content (Nelu, 2024). These examples demonstrate the dual-use nature of AI, where technologies designed to benefit society are exploited by malicious actors to spread violent extremism.

Moreover, research by Fernandez & Alani (2018) and Hall et al. (2020) explains that AI-generated content is often indistinguishable from genuine content, making it challenging for traditional detection methods, such as keyword filters and manual review, to identify and mitigate these threats. This issue is worsened by studies on human interaction with AI-generated content, which reveal that individuals are often unable to distinguish between genuine and fake information, a vulnerability exploited by terrorists to spread misinformation and radicalise individuals (Burton, 2023). However, research also shows that AI may aid in identifying and countering extremist narratives by analysing vast amounts of data to detect patterns and flag potential threats (Davis, 2021).

These findings mark the urgency for advanced AI-driven detection technologies capable of effectively identifying and countering AI-generated terrorist content. Yet, this raises a significant concern: will this just lead to a world where machines fight machines online? The escalation of AI in both generating and countering content might result in an ongoing technological arms race, forcing continuous advancements in AI capabilities to stay ahead of malicious actors. This situation represents a broad network of digital warfare characterised by various means of attack and defence, involving multiple entities, factors and enablers, such as social media platforms, illustrating the shifting ratio between digital and kinetic warfare, the consequences and the blurring boundaries between the two.

A report by the United Nations Interregional Crime and Justice Research Institute (2021) suggest that AI-based systems can analyse social media activity to identify indicators of radicalisation, such as changes in language use and engagement with extremist content. Additionally, AI can monitor and analyse specific online communities to identify threats and respond to potential terrorist activities (Mashechkin et al., 2019; Nizzoli et al., 2021).

1.3 Tactics in transition: NATO'S struggle against AI-enhanced extremist content

As presented, extremists continuously evolve their methods for creating and disseminating content, while traditional CT tactics are increasingly strained. The

following analysis examines three key methods central to various defence and security organisations in their online CT efforts, highlighting their insufficiencies in addressing AI-powered extremism.

Firstly, NATO has historically relied on manual content monitoring as a cornerstone of its online CT strategy (Cordy, 2017; *NATO's Approach to Countering Disinformation*, 2023). This approach involves human operators precisely scanning various digital platforms to identify and remove extremist content. While initially effective, this method is inherently limited by its time-consuming and labour-intensive nature (Shen & Zhang, 2024). The advent of AI has increased this challenge, as the volume and speed of terrorist content generation now far exceed human capabilities (Baele & Brace, 2024).

AI algorithms, not just bots, can produce and disseminate extremist propaganda at an unparalleled pace and scale, overwhelming manual monitoring efforts. For instance, a single AI model can generate thousands of unique propaganda messages in multiple languages within minutes (Ahuja et al., 2023), a task that would take human operators days or weeks to accomplish. These notable capabilities render manual monitoring as increasingly ineffective, leaving significant gaps in content detection, removal and mitigation (Shu et al., 2017). As a result, NATO faces a need to reassess its manual monitoring strategies in the face of AI-driven extremist content proliferation.

Secondly, automated content identification systems are perceived as an acceptable digital CT toolkit. These systems employ algorithms to scan vast amounts of online content, identifying keywords, phrases, and other markers associated with terrorist activity (Gallacher, 2019). However, the advent of AI-generated content has presented unprecedented challenges to these existing systems.

As Xu et al. (2021) note, AI models can continuously evolve, learning from each interaction. Consequently, it is likely to assume that AI models are capable of bypassing existing identification methods. This cat-and-mouse game puts pressure on NATO's current automated systems, which might struggle to keep pace with fast changing AI-generated content. This alarming result underscores the need for NATO to develop AI-driven content identification systems that can adapt in real-time to emerging threats.

Thirdly, the strategies used by other actors with which NATO collaborates, such as the EU, include traditional takedown requests that have been a staple in the EU's online CT strategy, involving the identification of extremist content and subsequent requests for its removal from hosting platforms (regulation 2021/784). However, this method has become increasingly ineffective in the face of AI-powered extremist content proliferation. The process is inherently delayed by significant time lags between content identification and removal; these delays can have severe consequences, such as the rapid spread of harmful propaganda, increased recruitment efforts by extremist groups, and the potential provocation of real-world violence resulting in harmful casualties, long before most takedown requests are even initiated (Berntsson & Janin, 2021).

AI has dramatically altered the scale and scope of extremist activities and has expanded the toolkit enabling that. This creates a frustrating cycle of takedowns and re-uploads that stretches the resources of CT units to their limits. Thus, content takedown requests have become largely ineffective in combating modern, AI-driven terrorist activities online. These conditions highlight the urgent need for NATO to develop new, AI-powered strategies that can match the speed and scale of current digital threats.

1.4 AI arsenal: A scheme for NATO to combat modern terrorism

To address this challenge, new forms of collaboration are essential, not only between member states but also between states and tech companies. The dual role of AI in both powering terrorist content and countering it poses a challenge for NATO. The evaluation of current strategies reveals a need for greater collaboration among member states and with private sector partners to develop robust AI-driven CT measures. This includes investing in research and development of AI technologies tailored for security applications.

The primary gap identified is the lack of broad strategies that integrate AI into counterterrorism in a way that keeps pace with the developing practices of threats. Existing counterterrorism measures often fall short in addressing the specific tactics employed by terrorists using AI, such as automated content generation, targeted propaganda distribution, and evasion of detection systems. There is a need for NATO to adopt a more proactive and novel approach, utilising AI to predict, detect, and counter terrorist content more effectively.

For instance, current detection methods may struggle to identify deepfakes and other AI-generated content that is designed to avoid traditional detection techniques, as mentioned. Additionally, there is a need for greater collaboration and information sharing among NATO member states and other stakeholders to develop and implement effective AI-driven counterterrorism strategies, as described:

1.4.1 Fighting AI with AI

NATO must spearhead the development of cutting-edge detection technologies. NATO can create sophisticated systems capable of identifying AI-generated content with great accuracy, by utilising AI solutions. Machine Learning (ML) algorithms can be trained to detect subtle patterns and anomalies indicative of extremist materials, from the less noticeable inconsistencies in deep fakes to the coordinated patterns of disinformation campaigns.

1.4.2 International collaboration and joint efforts

NATO must foster enhanced collaboration among its members, creating a synergy of knowledge and resources. For instance, countries at the forefront of technical AI research could lead the development of advanced detection algorithms, while those with extensive CT experience could refine and implement the practical aspects of these tools in real-world scenarios. Regular joint exercises, shared databases, and collaborative research initiatives may contribute for strengthening NATO's collective response to AI-driven threats.

1.4.3 Rewriting the playbook

NATO should re-assess current policies, strategies and regulation. This goes beyond the technological adaptation—it requires a comprehensive revaluation of the AI-mediated environment and its implications for global security. This includes updating regulations, establishing legal frameworks, and ensuring direct influence on EU states. Additionally, NATO should engage with international partners leading the charge in creating international norms and agreements on the ethical use of AI in warfare and security operations.

1.4.4 Considering security and liberty

NATO must address the ethical implications and maintain public trust. This involves assessing potential privacy violations against the need to mitigate security risks. NATO should be engaged in developing transparent AI systems, ensuring accountability in AI-driven decision-making processes, and the safeguarding of individual privacy rights should be at the forefront of AI strategy.

1.4.5 Staying ahead of the curve

NATO should establish a dedicated AI Research and Development wing, tasked with staying abreast of the latest advancements in AI technology and their potential applications in both terrorist activities and CT efforts. Regular scenario planning exercises, incorporating cutting-edge AI developments, could help NATO anticipate and prepare for future threats.

By implementing these strategies, NATO can position itself at the frontline of AI-driven CT efforts, effectively turning the tables on those who would exploit these technologies for malicious purposes. The key to success will lie in swift action, firm collaboration, ethical consideration, and a commitment to continuous innovation in the face of evolving digital threats.

1.5 Conclusion

Considering the set of characteristics presented, the new digital ecology may be described as a chessboard where AI plays both sides—terrorist and CT. In this life-or-death game, NATO finds itself at a critical juncture, facing an opponent that can generate thousands of moves in the blink of an eye. The rules have changed, and the traditional playbook is quickly becoming obsolete.

To effectively combat AI-enhanced extremist content, NATO must adopt a multidimensional strategy that will utilise AI's potential for good. This includes developing advanced AI-driven detection technologies, fostering better international collaboration, updating and influencing policies and regulations, addressing ethical concerns, and maintaining a proactive stance through ongoing research and development. By fighting AI with AI, NATO can turn the tide on those who would exploit these technologies for harmful purposes.

Ultimately, the success of NATO's CT practices in the AI era will depend on its ability to adapt swiftly, collaborate effectively, and innovate continuously. As the digital forefront advances, so too must NATO's strategies and capabilities. Embracing AI-driven solutions and balancing security needs with ethical considerations, NATO can position itself at the vanguard of the fight against online extremism, ensuring a safer digital future for all.

References

- Ahuja, K., Hada, R., Ochieng, M., Jain, P., Diddee, H., Maina, S., Ganu, T., Segal, S., Axmed, M., Bali, K., & Sitaram, S. (2023). MEGA: Multilingual Evaluation of Generative AI. arXiv (Cornell University). https://doi.org/10.48550/arxiv.2303.12528
- Baele, S. J., & Brace, L. (2024). AI extremism: technologies, tactics, actors. In VOX-Pol Network of Excellence. VOX-Pol Network of Excellence. Retrieved July 10, 2024, from https://voxpol.eu/wp-content/uploads/2024/04/DCUPN0254-Vox-Pol-AI-Extremism-WEB-240424.pdf
- Berntsson, J., & Janin, M. (2021, October 14). Online regulation of terrorist and harmful content. Lawfare. Retrieved July 10, 2024, from https://www.lawfaremedia.org/article/online-regulation-terrorist-and-harmful-content
- Burton, J. (2023). Algorithmic extremism? The securitization of artificial intelligence (AI) and its impact on radicalism, polarization and political violence. Technology in society, 75, 102262.
- Burton, J., & Soare, S. R. (2019, May). Understanding the strategic implications of the weaponization of artificial intelligence. In 2019 11th international conference on Cyber Conflict (CyCon) (Vol. 900, pp. 1-17). IEEE.
- Cordy, J. (2017). The Social Media Revolution: political and security implications. In NATO Parliamentary Assembly (158 CDSDG 17 E bis). NATO – North Atlantic Treaty Organization. Retrieved July 10, 2024, from https://www.nato-pa.int/download-file?filename=/sites/default/files/2017-11/2017%20-%20158%20CDSDG%2017%20E%20bis%20-%20SOCIAL%20MEDIA%20REVOLUTION%20-%20CORDY%20REPORT.pdf
- Davis, A. L. (2021). Artificial Intelligence and the Fight Against International Terrorism. American Intelligence Journal, 38(2), 63-73.
- Fernandez, M., & Alani, H. (2021). Artificial intelligence and online extremism: challenges and opportunities. In J. McDaniel & K. Pease (Eds.), Predictive policing and artificial intelligence (pp. 132–162). Routledge. https://doi.org/10.4324/9780429265365
- Gallacher, J. (2019). Automated detection of terrorist and extremist content. In B. Ganesh & J. Bright (Eds.), Extreme Digital Speech: Contexts, Responses and Solutions. VOX-Pol Network of Excellence. Retrieved July 10, 2024, from https://pure.rug.nl/ws/portalfiles/portal/117363986/DCUJ770_VOX_Extreme_Digital_Speech_4.pdf
- Graham, R. (2016). How terrorists use encryption. CTC Sentinel, 9(6), 20–25. https://ctc.westpoint.edu/wp-content/uploads/2016/06/CTC-SENTINEL_Vol9Iss614.pdf
- Hall, M., Logan, M., Ligon, G. S., & Derrick, D. C. (2019). Do machines replicate humans? Toward a unified understanding of radicalizing content on the open social web. Policy & Internet, 12(1), 109–138. https://doi.org/10.1002/poi3.223
- Juršėnas, A., Karlauskas, K., Ledinauskas, E., Maskeliūnas, G. & Ruseckas, J. (2021). The double-edged sword of AI: Enabler of disinformation. NATO Strategic Communications Centre of Excellence. https://stratcomcoe.org/publications/the-double-edged-sword-of-ai-enabler-of-disinformation/221
- Kandemir, B. & Brand, A. (2018). Social Media in Operations – a Counter-Terrorism Perspective. NATO Strategic Communications Centre of

Excellence. https://stratcomcoe.org/publications/social-media-in-operations-a-counter-terrorism-perspective/136
- NATO. (2024, April 11). Key priorities. Retrieved June 28, 2024, from https://www.nato.int/cps/en/natohq/85291.htm
- Lakomy, M. (2023). Artificial intelligence as a terrorism enabler? Understanding the potential impact of chatbots and image generators on online terrorist activities. Studies in Conflict and Terrorism, 1–21. https://doi.org/10.1080/1057610x.2023.2259195
- Mashechkin, I. V., Petrovskiy, M. I., Tsarev, D. V., & Chikunov, M. N. (2019). Machine learning methods for detecting and monitoring extremist information on the internet. Programming and Computer Software, 45, 99-115.
- Mathur, P., Broekaert, C., & Clarke, C. P. (2024, May 1). The radicalization (and counter-radicalization) potential of artificial intelligence. International Centre for Counter-Terrorism. https://www.icct.nl/publication/radicalization-and-counter-radicalization-potential-artificial-intelligence
- NATO's approach to countering disinformation. (2023, November 8). NATO – North Atlantic Treaty Organization. Retrieved July 10, 2024, from https://www.nato.int/cps/en/natohq/topics_219728.htm
- Nelu, C. (2024, June 10). Exploitation of generative AI by terrorist groups. International Centre for Counter-Terrorism – ICCT. Retrieved July 12, 2024, from https://www.icct.nl/publication/exploitation-generative-ai-terrorist-groups
- Nizzoli, L., Avvenuti, M., Tesconi, M., Cresci, S., Di Pietro, R., Quattrociocchi, W., & Gini, F. (2021). Leveraging Social Media and AI to foster Secure Societies against Online and Offline Threats (Doctoral dissertation, University of Pisa, Italy).
- Olson, R. S., Sipper, M., La Cava, W., Tartarone, S., Vitale, S., Fu, W., Orzechowski, P., Urbanowicz, R. J., Holmes, J. H., & Moore, J. H. (2018). A system for accessible artificial intelligence. In Genetic and evolutionary computation (pp. 121–134). https://doi.org/10.1007/978-3-319-90512-9_8
- Passaris, C. E. (2020). Empowering democracy through Internetization. HAPSc Policy Briefs Series, 1(2), 59. https://doi.org/10.12681/hapscpbs.26449
- Rana, M. S., Nobi, M. N., Murali, B., & Sung, A. H. (2022). Deepfake detection: A systematic literature review. IEEE access, 10, 25494-25513.
- Sayed, W. S., Noeman, A. M., Abdellatif, A., Abdelrazek, M., Badawy, M. G., Hamed, A., & El-Tantawy, S. (2023). AI-based adaptive personalized content presentation and exercises navigation for an effective and engaging E-learning platform. Multimedia Tools and Applications, 82(3), 3303-3333.
- Shen, Y., & Zhang, X. (2024). The impact of artificial intelligence on employment: the role of virtual agglomeration. Humanities & Social Sciences Communications, 11(1). https://doi.org/10.1057/s41599-024-02647-9
- Shu, K., Sliva, A., Wang, S., Tang, J., & Liu, H. (2017). Fake news detection on social media: A data mining perspective. SIGKDD Explorations, 19(1), 22–36. https://doi.org/10.1145/3137597.3137600
- Tambini, D. (2018). Social media power and election legitimacy. In D. Tambini and M. Moore (Eds.), Digital dominance: the power of Google, Amazon, Facebook, and Apple (pp. pp. 265–293). Oxford University Press.
- Tech Against Terrorism. (2023). Early terrorist experimentation with generative artificial intelligence services. Retrieved July 12, 2024, from https://techagainstterrorism.org/hubfs/Tech%20Against%20Terrorism%20Briefing%20-%20Early%20terrorist%20experimentation%20with%20generative%20artificial%20intelligence%20services.pdf
- United Nations Interregional Crime and Justice Research Institute. (2021). Countering Terrorism online with Artificial intelligence: An Overview for Law Enforcement and Counter-Terrorism Agencies in South Asia and South-East Asia. In UNICRI - United Nations Interregional Crime and Justice Research Institute. Retrieved July 9, 2024, from https://unicri.it/News/-Countering-Terrorism-Online-with-Artificial-Intelligence
- Venkatesh, V. (2021). Adoption and use of AI tools: a research agenda grounded in UTAUT. Annals of Operation Research/Annals of Operations Research, 308(1–2), 641–652. https://doi.org/10.1007/s10479-020-03918-9
- Westerlund, M. (2019). The emergence of deepfake technology: A review. Technology innovation management review, 9(11).
- Woolley, S. C., & Howard, P. N. (2018). Conclusion: Political parties, politicians, and computational propaganda. In S. C. Woolley & P. N. Howard (Eds.), Computational Propaganda: Political Parties, Politicians, and Political Manipulation on social media (pp. 241–248). Oxford University Press. https://doi.org/10.1093/oso/9780190931407.001.0001
- Xu, Y., Liu, X., Cao, X., Huang, C., Liu, E., Qian, S., Liu, X., Wu, Y., Dong, F., Qiu, C., Qiu, J., Hua, K., Su, W., Wu, J., Xu, H., Han, Y., Fu, C., Yin, Z., Liu, M., . . . Zhang, J. (2021). Artificial intelligence: A powerful paradigm for scientific research. The Innovation, 2(4), 100179. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.xinn.2021.100179
- Zgryziewicz, R. (2016). Daesh recruitment. How the group attracts supporters. NATO Strategic Communications Centre of Excellence. https://stratcomcoe.org/publications/daesh-recruitment-how-the-group-attracts-supporters/184content/uploads/2024/04/DCUPN0254-Vox-Pol-AI-Extremism- WEB-240424.pdf